Notes

1. As in the case of the discourses dealing with the meetings with Śāla and Uddaka, only the first discourse of the PTS edition (p. 38) gives the text in Pāli; the Thai, Burmese and Māla editions all give the full text in each case.


6. The Mahāvastu is here very corrupt; see Répoton's suggested corrections, which are followed here (Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Dictionary, repr. Delhi 1977, p. 159b, sthāvatī). Whatever the original may have been, the general idea is confirmed by the Pāli, Lālita-vistarā (p. 128.25), Abhinīkaraṇa (19.1.7) and Vinyavasīta (37.5.2), and Jones' rendering (op. cit., p. 125) is certainly wrong. F.S. Bohm's translation from the Pāli (op. cit., p. 301), though perhaps not literally wrong, is unhappy and fails to bring out the meaning clearly; Bhikkhu Śāṇḍikā's rendering (op. cit., Vol. 1, p. 280, Vol. 3, p. 171) is much preferable.

Abbreviations and Terms Used

Pāli: the PTS (Pali Text Society, London), the Burmese script Candaṇa-saṇṭikī (Candaṇa), the Thai script (Mahāpātika niśāvadāna, Bangkok) and the Mālaṇḍā (Mālaṇḍā, Bhār) editions have been consulted for the passages dealt with here; of these the Burmese gives the best readings, which are mainly followed by the Mālaṇḍā edition, which adds modern punctuation. References to other Pāli texts, except when otherwise noted, are to PTS editions, with standard abbreviations.

Tibetan: the Peking edition of the Tibetan Tripitaka (P), Suzuki Research Foundation reprint, Tokyo-Kyoto, has been used; references are to catalogue number, followed by volume number, page, folio and line.

Names: for the sake of consistency, the Pāli forms (buddhistta, uddaka, etc.) have been used, except in direct citations from the Sanskrit.

News & Notes

Conference on Mahāvīra Sanskrit Literature

The third conference sponsored by the Kommission für buddhistische Studien der Akademie der Wissenschaften was held in Göttingen between 13th-16th July 1982. The occasion also made to coincide with the 80th birthday of Ernst Walser, the donor of researchers in Central Asian literature.

An indication of the scope of the proceedings is provided by the titles of those papers (all of which will be published in 1983) which are likely to prove of most interest to our readers: E. Küster "Zur Frage der Schuldhaftigkeit der Frühen buddhistischen Geschichtsschreibung. Einführung in das Mahāvīra-Textbuch, 1. Buch, 3. Kapitel", A. Kure "Sanskrit Literature in the Modern Period", G. Kume "The Mahāvyāna in the South

The fifth conference of The International Association of Buddhist Studies was held at Hartford College, Oxford, between 16th-21st August 1982, under the presidency of Prof. Dr. Walpola Rāhula. It had been organized by the local Secretary (and Hon.Secretary of the Pali Text Society), Prof. Richard Gombrich.

All aspects of Buddhism were covered, including special sessions on Buddhist Logic and Epistemology, Art and Iconography, Anthropology of Buddhism, Tibetan Religion and Philosophical Thought, and Contemporary Japanese Buddhism. Reports were received on the Critical Pali Dictionary, Pāli Tripitaka Concordance, Pāli-English Dictionary (proposed revised edition) and the Journal of the PTS (proposed revival). (By the Editor-in-Chief of the CD and President of the PTS, K.R. Norman), Pāli-English Dictionary (French-language encyclopedia of Buddhism based in Kyoto - Robert Durl), "Sanskrit Dictionary of Buddhist Texts from the Pāli Canon" (Sigismonde Diets), Systematic Survey of Buddhist Sanskrit Literature (Akira Yuraya - who presented the same report in German in Göttingen), and "Group for Buddhist and Jain Philological Studies" in France (Gérard Passman).

The papers included Thich Thiện Chau "The Literature of Pudgalavāda", S. Collins "Friendship as a Buddhist Virtue", E. Guarnasce "Mahāvyāna and Viśuddhimagga", S. Diets "Some Problems concerning the Abhidharma Fragments from Gilgit", Mirko Pfeil "Applications of Bhāma in Western Therapy", R. Gombrich
Catalogue of Buddhist MSS

Assessing the literary holdings of archives and libraries is a necessary prerequisite to revealing their contents by means of text edition and translation. Thus, the first issue in the series, "Catalogue of Oriental manuscripts, xylographs, etc. in Danish collections" is a welcome addition to this literature. The late C.B. Godskensbura (see PR II 65) has produced a Catalogue of Ceylonese Manuscripts (1950) which not only updates previous descriptive lists of Pali, Sanskrit and Sinhala texts in the possession of the publishers, the Royal Danish Library, Copenhagen, but incorporates the manuscripts in private hands. (For details of the Rana Collection, the nucleus of the Library's collection of Pali texts, and the work of editors and lexicographers in Denmark, see Russell Webb "Pali Buddhist Studies in Denmark" PR II 162.) The above volume complements similar works from the same source, viz. G. Coedes Catalogue des manuscrits en pali, laotien et annamien provenant de la Thailande (1966) - each of which was translated for H. Baddhāraṇa's paper, "Pali Literature from Laos" (Studies in Pali and Buddhism, ed. A.K. Bazar, Delhi 1975) - and V. Heljeva and C. Jensen Catalogue of Mongol Books, Manuscripts and Xylographs (1971).

In London, as far back as 1876 E. Haas compiled a Catalogue of Sanskrit and Pali Books in the British Museum. Cecil Isdall later prepared a Catalogue of Sanskrit, Pali and Pali-Prakrit books in the British Museum (1903), followed by L.B. Barnett's 2nd and 3rd Supplements (1908 and 1928) which are still available. JPTS II (1963), repr. 1976 featured a "List of Pali MSS in the British Museum" (and similar lists for Cambridge, Copenhagen and Stockholm) by R.J.H. Holmberg who supplemented it in Vol. VII (1968). Unpublished supplements were subsequently drafted by him (1993) and Barnett (1930). Related to these materials is the Neville Collection of Sinhalese Manuscripts from which the long-awaited Catalogue of Pali-Sinhalese Buddhist Texts, compiled by K. D. Somadasa, is expected to be published in autumn 1983. However, several lists have already appeared, viz. M.de Z. Wickremasinghe Catalogue of the Sinhalese manuscripts in the British Museum (1900), Somadasa Lañāka punakāla pot-nāmakya (3 vols, Colombo 1959-64),
Obituary

Rune E. A. Johnson

Only as a result of unrelated correspondence has the Editor learned of the death of Dr. Johnson at his home in Stockholm, Sweden, sometime during the summer of 1961. (His widow declined to reply to the Editor's request for further details but it is known that her husband was obliged to retire from Lund University for health reasons some years ago.)

Born 1916, he studied Psychology, Sanskrit and Pali at Lund and obtained his licentiate in 1934. He continued his studies in Sanskrit at the University of Calcutta and in Pali at the University of Ceylon where he prepared a long paper on "Sutta, Pāli, Viṁśaṭa - a Psychoanalytic Investigation" (University of Ceylon Series XXIII, 1965). His English study, The Psychopathy of Buddha (London 1969), was the first major attempt to fit all the different explanations of Nirvāṇa contained in the Pali Canon into a connected picture, relating the whole to Western psychology. A sequel to this work, based upon the formula of Pali - assagāthā, was published in 1970 by the Scandinavian Institute of Asian Studies in Copenhagen under the title, The Dynamic Psychology of Early Buddhism. The first Pali grammar in Swedish was composed by him. Entitled, Buddhakritsa Pāṭiti Pāli, it appeared in the Årabok 1957-60 which was published in 1969 by the "Seminar for Altoriental Language" at Lund University. An expanded version in English - Pali Buddhist Texts explained to the beginner - was subsequently published by the Scandinavian Institute (Copenhagen 1973). Apart from this primer and a short essay on "Psychological Causality in Early Buddhism" (FMR III 22), Johnson's most notable achievements were the translations of the Dhammapada (the first directly from the Pali - Stockholm 1967) and the Sutta-Nikāya (Buddhakritsa Pāṭiti Pāli, Stockholm 1976). For some inexplicable reason the publisher omitted six suttas (Parīñāma, Visuddha, Mahāvagga, Mahāsamikika, Māgha and Kūkṣiya) from the latter collection and these subsequently appeared in Buddhakritsa Pāṭiti Pāli, the journal of an association with the same name, during 1970-9.

The Dynamic Psychology of Early Buddhism (scheduled for reprint in 1983), Pali Buddhist Texts (revised and enlarged ed. 1961) and the Sutta-Nikāya translation were reviewed for this journal (IV 72: 123 and 77 1961 and 66 1967 respectively). The author provided much of the background material to the Editor's survey on "Pali Buddhist Studies in Sweden" (FMR IV 25).

His is undoubtedly a serious loss to Pali Buddhist research in Scandinavia. May he be at peace.

Book Reviews

A Treasury of the Buddha's Words: Discourses from the Middle Collection. Translated by Nāmasāli Thera, edited and arranged by Aina Khamtikī. 3 vols., Mahasāri, Bangkāk, but available only from Wat Buddha-Dhamma, Ten Mile Hollow, Wissahikha Press, BNII 2255, Australia.

The late Ven. Nāmasāli, in his short career, produced an extraordinary number of translations from the Pali in addition to his masterly version of the Vāsakajāma, a substantial part of which (90 out of the 122 suttas) is here made available. Since it is well-known that the Pāli translations of the Canon (even to some extent the Horner Middle Length Sutta) are in need of revision, this is to be welcomed. Nāmasāli was a skilled and dedicated worker in this field, who constantly strove after elucidation of the texts and experimented with different renderings in his search for the hat justa. While not all his ideas may have been right, they are usually worthy of serious consideration. Another well-known English bhikkhu, Ven. Khamtikī, has made the selection, organizing the chosen sutta according to a scheme of his own without regard to their canonical order. Thus the contents of Vol.I, entitled Buddhakritsa, comprises (a) "Pāli of the People" and (b) "Buddha's Life", Vol.II, Being on Talking, comprises (a) "Mind, Meditation and Training" and (b) "Dialogue and View", while Vol.III consists of Part I, Faith and Frailty: (a) "Understanding (Wisdom, Insight)" and (b) "Attainment", and Part IV, The Buddha: (a) "Striving and Enlightenment" and (b) "The Tathāgata". The scheme is carefully thought out, and the selection and arrangement provide a coherent and progressive course of study which may recommend itself to the lay reader. There is a 25-page introduction to the whole, and there are individual introductions to the suttas, all but two of them by the editor. On the whole it may be said that an excellent job has been done by both translator and editor, so that one's reservations remain limited to a few points.

The problem of style in translating from Pali is a difficult one and when the meaning of the words is not in dispute, I find, almost at random, a small passage from Sutta No. to illustrate how Miss Horner and Nāmasāli respectively tackled the task. (Horner) Then King Pāsawadi addressed Dīgha Kārīyana, saying: "Good Kārīyana, here comes a lovely vehicle; we are going to the garden of the pleasure to see its beauty", "Yes, sire", and Dīgha Kārīyana, having answered King Pāsawadi in answer, having had many lovely vehicles, announced to King Pāsawadi: "Many lovely vehicles are harnesses for you, sire. You may even it is now the right time for that.

(Nāmasāli) Then the King Pāsawadi told Dīgha Kārīyana: "My friend, have the state carriages get ready. Let us go to the Pleasure Garden to see a
pleasing spot." "Yes, sir," he replied. When the state carriages were ready, he informed the king: "Sir, the state carriages are ready for you. Now it is time to do as you think fit."

Readers may judge for themselves which version they prefer. It is obvious that the proximity of the original must be out in any translations; even Miss Horner has done this a little (though one might not think so) and Nāṇāmoli's version too could still further out without loss. At this point I must declare an interest, in both senses of the word. Being engaged on a new translation of the Dhamma Nikāya, I am naturally directly concerned with the problem and have already learned much from a close study of Nāṇāmoli's way of tackling it. The quoted passage contains nothing remotely "controversial", as some passages inevitably do. Sometimes Nāṇāmoli allowed his enthusiasm for "experimental" renderings to run away with him, and the introduction lists a number of cases where more conventional translations have been substituted for terms introduced by him. His use of "divine" for "devasinsa", which seems to me to be a not altogether happy conceit, has however been retained. Arguably, though, his "thinking and pondering" for vyākka-vattha is preferable to the substituted "initial and sustained application". However, I will not go further into such matters here. In sum, it seems to me that in the difficult search for a suitable style of translation, Nāṇāmoli made significant advances without, perhaps, always attaining the ideal version.

Ven. Khantibba's introduction is excellent and covers a lot of ground. Here, I will merely draw attention to his remarks (p. xxii) on the classification of suttas according as the doctrine is stated in terms of dhammas or in terms of persons. His comments on the purely intellectual understanding some people have of the suttas (or of Abhidhamma), and of its limitations, are judicious. He also expresses his opinions, forthrightly but fairly, on one or two other matters. And in general, his introductions to the individual suttas are equally valuable. However, I confess I found his remarks on the Cūpadāya Nikāya Sutta (No. 108; Vol.I, p. 223) a trifle disturbing, the more especially as coming from the author of an excellent book on tolerance! His statement that "in Mahāyāna the Buddha becomes an eternal God" is, as regards most Mahāyāna schools at least, incorrect, while his remark on the same page that "patriarchates wherever found in Buddhism are bogus" is needlessly tactless.

Finally, I would offer one suggested solution to a small problem and a few technical criticisms. The note on p.96 of Vol.II mentions an "untraceable word in the original as 'meteorative'? or 'metoricative', 'metericative'?". I suggest that the word is probably 'moterative', which makes fair sense. The book is well printed and produced and attractive in form, but something seems to have gone wrong with the chapter-headings of the suttas which should have been checked. I will merely instance the Dhammaññutta Sutta (Vol.I, p.246), which is given the meaningless name of Cittamaduttasutta. There is also a discrepancy between the title on the cover, A Treasury of the Buddha's Words... and that on the title-page, A Treasury of the Buddha's Discourses... which will be the despair of all cataloguers. Also, the only clue as to the book's date is that given at the end of the introduction: 1977. If it really was published as long ago as all that, it must have been an unconscionable time in coming to the notice of the outside world - which is a great pity.

Maurice Walshe

New translations of the Dhammapāda


With already over thirty English translations of this ever popular anthology, it seems surprising that yet more Buddah scholars should attempt further renditions, especially in view of the fact that quite a number of Pali texts remain either untranslated or in urgent need of retranslation.

However, the translators of the first two versions under review justify producing "new" versions even if, after a succession of textual permutations spanning a century, the arguments employed no longer sound convincing. (Since the third version is wholly in Thai with the exception of the actual stanzas I cannot ascertain the translator's reasons for producing it, other than incorporating the full text in Thai script and a Thai translation.) Thus, Ven. Khantibba states: "English translations of the Dhammapāda..., are costly in prose. This seems that although they may be accurate, beauty and ease of memorizing have been sacrificed. The few attempts at a metrical rendering... have resulted in another extreme - the loss of accuracy through attention given to poetic trills and even to rhyme. Pali verses do not employ rhyme and distortion of meaning in inevitable if a translator tries to press the Buddha's words into it. // An English translation must, of course, lose some of the subtle meanings, particularly in the case of words derived from a single root in Pali, where there are no similar forms in English. The present translation is the result of a long effort to present the Buddha's words in a way that is both memorable and accurate - as far as this can be achieved. For this reason, verse form was chosen and the work was also based on an earlier attempt (Growing the
Bodhi Tree, Buddhist Association of Thailand, Bangkok 1966" (p.47). Dr Kaviratna, the Sinhalese Director of the Oriental Institute, Naples, states: "Some commentators have curious and artificial renderings, which are not akin to the stream of Buddhist and Vedic thought prevalent in India during the time of the Buddha. Most of the European and Indian translators have based their renditions upon these artificial commentaries without any deep penetration into the philosophic currents of that early period. // For this...volume, I have diligently compared the best European translations...with Sanskrit, Burmese and Chinese versions. Special care has been taken to bring out a faithful word-for-word rendition that is lucid, free of bias and, as far as possible, true to the wisdom and pristine grace of the original Pali texts" (p.xxviii).

Ven. Khantiṭṭho has professed his version with two essays on "The Buddha's Teaching from the Dhammapada" and "Everyday Buddhist" which both introduce the text within the context of the Buddha's teaching and "comment on Dhammapada verses which apply to common events in everyday life". They are framed within the conventional style of traditional Theravāda Dhamma-sānti, illuminating a timeless teaching but need not, of course, necessarily need to be read prior to beginning the text. Each verse ends with its own notes which are kept to a minimum but are indispensable in many cases, particularly where variant readings suggest themselves. Kaviratna avoids inserting notes (except where absolutely necessary) but includes the romanised Pali text on each page facing the translation and endeavours to expand the text to overcome possible ambiguity, thus v.370:

"(Of the fetters) cut off the five, remit the five, and (of the virtues) cultivate the five. He who has gone beyond the five attachments is called a bhikkhu who has crossed the stream."

Whereas Khantiṭṭho puts it thus: "Five cut off and five foresake, a further five should be developed; a bhikkhu from five fetters free is called 'A-forder-of-the-flood'" - but explains the formulas in a footnote.

The admirable attempt of the latter to reproduce the didactic sayings of the Buddha in verse and as accurately as possible does unfortunately result in occasional staccato effects; thus, vv.21-22:

"Heedfulness - the path to the Deathless, heedlessness - the path to death; the helpful ones do not die, the heedless are likened to the dead. The wise, then, recognizing this as the distinction of heedfulness.

Kaviratna's equivalent renderings in prose, however, tend to flow in a more relaxed manner (but no doubt the temptation to elaborate beyond the strict confines of the original text is always present), thus:

"Vigilance is the path to immortality; non-vigilance is the path to death; the vigilant do not die; the non-vigilant, though alive, are like unto the dead.

Knowing this outstanding feature of vigilance, the wise delight in vigilance, rejoicing in the ways of the Noble Ones (ariyas)."

But the latter mode is surely preferable when what is at stake is comprehension and lucidity, thus Kaviratna renders v.16:

"The doer of wholesome deeds rejoices here and rejoices hereafter; thus he rejoices in both places. Having beheld his pure deeds he rejoices exceedingly."

Khantiṭṭho, on the contrary, tries to scan the verse by inexplicably using a noun as a verb: "Here he joys, he joys hereafter: in both wise does the merit-maker joys; he joys, then does he rejoice, his own pure human being."

The term "delight" may not be strong enough to convey the sense of the original term but what is wrong with the tried and tested term "rejoices"?

It would be physically impossible to make comparisons of this nature throughout the two main translations under review. A choice of stances must necessarily be subjective, but, whereas there are many fine metrical renderings in Khantiṭṭho's version which aptly crystallize the Buddha's teaching of direct appeal to heart and mind, it has nevertheless to be admitted that the general rule of losing an intangible quality by means of secondary verse translations holds good. For that reason, no doubt, most translators adopt the safer and less arduous method of prose translation. (Sutchienpong's translation, despite an impressive Foreword by Prof. S. Tambah, has been ignored here because of its similarity with Nandas's classic rendering which, in the minds of many, including that of the late I.B. Horner, constitutes the most authoritative reckoning.)

Kaviratna has included a list of the rarest Dhammapada manuscripts and their provenance in Sri Lanka together with a Pali-Sanskrit-English glossary of key terms related to the relevant verses. Khantiṭṭho has provided appropriate line drawings to illustrate the main themes in each vāgga. an index of first lines in English and, most useful of all, a "Thematic Index" of subjects descri-
which the Buddha sometimes made up when explaining words by means of a non-historical etymology or etiology, e.g. the explanation of bhāmaṇa as bhāta-rāna “one who has expelled his evil”. This type of equivalence is more appropriately called “folk-etymology” and is found in other languages besides Pali, e.g. asparaga (“asparagus”) in “grass for asparagus”. Folk etymology is a very important subject in its own right and merits an independent monograph, but meanwhile it is helpful to have Dhp.halē's list of some of the more important examples found in the Tipiṭaka. A further extension of the usage of the term “synonymy” takes us beyond the point where the English definition of the word is appropriate, for in his treatment of etymology Dhp.halē includes the 100 epithets of the Buddha found in Uālī’s verses in the Itikkara-nikāya, although it does not really seem possible to regard a word such as nara “man” as a synonym for bhāva.

Much of this book is theoretical and analytical in nature, and to that extent it is perhaps too academic for ordinary students of Pali. The needs of such are, however, partly catered for by providing a number of examples of the way in which synonomy enables a reader to decide upon the meaning of a Pali word which by itself is ambiguous or even unintelligible. There are particularly striking examples in the case of synonymous cognates, when a word is explained by a derivation from the same root but with a different affix, e.g. sametika usually means “lamb” in Sanskrit, but the meaning “body” is assured for some contexts in Pali by the occurrence of adha “body” as a synonym.

Although, as noted above, the author has gone further in some directions than the usual definition of “synonymy” would seem to allow, the limitation of his enquiry to the Tipiṭaka means that the use of the phenomenon in non-canonical and commentarial texts still awaits investigation. One can do no better than to quote the pair of synonyms with which Dr Dhp.halē himself concludes his book: bahucakāra maya bahukāraṇa ṣa “we have much to do, we have much to perform”.

K.R. Norman


Although the Vuttadāna is the only extant Pali text dealing with metrics and prosody, it has attracted little interest from English-speaking scholars since G.B. Pfeifer published an edition and English translation of it, with extensive notes, in the Journal of the Asiatic Society of Bengal in 1877. In 1929 R. Śīḍhartha produced another edition and English translation in the Journal of
the Department of Letters, University of Calcutta, but this seems to have escaped the notice of most scholars; it is, for example, not mentioned in the Spilergoena to the Critical Pali Dictionary.

The publication under review is a photo-mechanical reprint of the 1922 article. Certain unprinted or, rather, unprinted scanning marks have been left uncorrected, while their number has been increased by defects in the photographic process. Although the page headings give the author's name as Siddhartha, the new title page calls his Siddharmo. The original article lacked an introduction, and there is consequently no information available about the way in which the edition was made, although there are references in footnotes to the readings of "some editions". Nor are we told which commentaries were employed when making the translation, although two references to the text suggest that the editor had this available to him.

The Vatthasana was written by Saigharshikhita in Ceylon during the reign of Parshuramabahu (A.D. 1153-66). It is based upon Vedaharshitha's (Sanskrit) VratarathaBhava, as Professor de Jong states in the newly added Preface which gives a brief, but very valuable, bibliographical survey of Vatthaana studies. In 136 stanzas, or portions of stanzas, including an introduction in four stanzas, and a conclusion in three (which Siddhartha omits), Saigharshitha describes a large number of Pali metres, each description being, in fact, a Pala of the relevant metre. He does not, however, describe all Pali metres. He omits the canonical form of the Ayoga metre found in a few of the very oldest texts in the Pali Canon, and does not mention the Upapattipacakita metre found in the LokanaSutta of the Dhamma-nikaya. A possible explanation for this is that when Saigharshitha states that he will describe the Lokana metres, he is omitting the Sanskrit usage of Lokana, i.e., popular (post-Vedic) as opposed to Vedic prosody. He therefore means non-canonical Pali metres and is consequently justified in omitting mention of metres found only in the Canon.

Siddhartha's work has certain defects. Since the Vatthasana states that the mark of the long syllable is curved, and that of the short syllable straight, Siddhartha adopts this system throughout his translation, e.g., he shows the dactyl as "-, instead of "-, which is the normal European form, and the unmoved reader is likely to be misled. There are also errors in his translation. He translates am as "metres which are regular" and aathana as "metres that are partly regular", whereas Pryer is more accurate with "metres the quarters of which are similar" and "metres the half lines of which are similar", for adhechana refers to metres such as Vaitthiya in which the first and third, and second and fourth, planes are similar.

Since Pryer gives a critical apparatus for his edition, states the commentaries which he has consulted and quotes from them, gives more detailed comments upon his translation, and offers several examples of each metre described, it is perhaps to be regretted that the publishers chose to reprint Siddhartha's work rather than Pryer's. Nevertheless, this reprint is to be welcomed as being likely to draw attention to a somewhat neglected text.

K.R. Norman

Editor. A work related in these to the foregoing two is Topics in Pali Historical Phonology, published by Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi 1979, at Rs 60. Its author, Indira Yalungha, is Associate Professor in the Department of South Asian Studies, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, and teaches Indo-Aryan Linguistics, Sanskrit, Hindi, Marathi and Indian Philosophy. Her book is an account of the phonological development of the Pali language from Sanskrit times, which incorporates the latest developments in linguistic scholarship. Within the framework of generative phonology, it deals with a number of interesting aspects concerning sound changes. It examines the underlying forms, the bases for their posonalisation, redactional rules, and phonological rules, their order with respect to each other and with respect to the rules in The father set. The study operates synchronically from historical processes, inherited rules from innovated rules, and generalised rules from particularised rules. Furthermore, it discusses re-constructing and global constraint, and suggests some phonological universals on the basis of Pali syllabatory processes.

This highly specialised study was also reviewed by the President of the PES for Linguistics, 22 (Amsterdam 1979, 20-51-59) to which the reader's attention is directed.

Deutsch-Pali Wörterbuch. Helmut Klar. Octopus Verlag, Vienna 1982. 544 pp. This German-Pali dictionary will, of course, be of interest only to those readers who know at least some German. It contains, we are told, 7,600 German words with 14,200 Pali equivalents. The author claims that as there are English-Pali dictionaries, it is time there was a German-Pali one, which can be used for practice translations into Pali (a possibly old-fashioned, but still useful exercise for those learning any language). He also claims that it could serve as an aid to scholars investigating the sociological and other such material found in, for instance, the Jatakas, though I am not quite sure how it is supposed to further this aim. It could, of course, also be of use to those, such as Oriental scholars, who know Pali already and are learning German.

Anyway, on reflection I realise that it probably has more uses than at first occurred to me; for instance, as a first brief appreciation to a Pali 'Roget's Thesaurus', as for many entries a number of synonyms are given (e.g.
For “Hindu” seven variant forms are shown, and for “Buddha” “guardian” five (e.g. Avalokiteśvara). In some cases an attempt at differentiation is made, but not in others. This feature, as far as it goes, can be quite useful to the student, and it might inspire somebody to attempt a real treatise on a larger scale.

Names are entered in the nominative form, not the ‘stemform’ as in the P3 Dictionary thus khaṇḍa not khaṇḍam, for the final nasal (n) I noted with interest that the author’s typewriter has the symbol n (really the international phonetic sign for ng as in sing) which was badly uncritically introduced instead of under- or over-dotted g. It has long seemed to me that the threefold representation of this letter causes quite unnecessary inconvenience as well as disputes. It should suffice to print an ordinary g, the student being simply taught that (as in French) a special nasal pronunciation occurs in syllable-final position: gī, gītā.

The choice of entries seems to me a little arbitrary, depending no doubt on the particular sources utilised. As the author is in fact a doctor, it may be assumed that the medical terms included are more accurate than in some other dictionnaires and translation.

The book is clearly a labour of love, is nicely produced in (for the most part) good clear typescript and very well bound, appropriately in yellow. Without checking every entry, I noticed a couple of mistakes and other small errors: on p.31 sāvatthā should read sāvatī (I have substituted a plain t here for the phonetic symbol mentioned above), and on p.31 veṇapī should of course be veṇapī (a word well known from the precepts). On p.32 āghanamānāgado occurs under two different head-words. The second of them, āghanamānāgato, ‘ Originiation, conditioned’, is fine; but the first, āghanamānāgato-phalāto ‘Originiation, dependent-simultaneous’, merely reflects the mistranslation of an earlier German scholar. There might be a case for including the term, but it should then be marked as incorrect. On the same page 32 I was delighted to find the ‘Buddhian’ antarjāna (‘un-becoming’) as a head-word for vīharm.

Souce: Malapide


This is an unusual book with a still more unusual history. The author was Danish and originally published his book in German around the beginning of this century. It was then translated and published in English (and I wonder why no Western publisher has thought it worthwhile republishing, now that interest in Buddhism is so much greater?), and sometime after rendered into Thai by the two famous literary figures whose pen-names are now the title of the above Foundation, Phya Anuman Rajadhon and Phra Saraphirom respectively.

After its translation into Thai it proved so very popular that it was eventually adapted for Buddhist sermon which to this day can be bought in Bangkok printed on the traditional palm-leaves. This is high praise indeed for a Western novel on the Buddha’s times! It has now, probably for the benefit of Thai students learning English, been presented by the enterprising firm of Sukpit Siam, in a bilingual edition. Copies may be obtained from the address above.

First, a few words about production and minor errors. This edition (the cheaper one), probably for students, is printed on a Thai paper resembling newsprint. That means its 500 old pages are not too bulky but on the other hand the book will not last long. Then the photographic reproduction of the English translation page by page with the Thai, though useful for learning languages, could have been done better. The covers are attractive Indian-style drawings while the text is graced with four drawings by the well-known Thai artist, Anokkorn Kalayanapong. It is surprising in view of the novel’s age that there are not more errors in the Buddhist parts of the book. Actually there are very few, notably a rather unclear list of Noble Eightfold Path factors on p.214. Also, on the same page, where the Three Characteristics are listed, Max Muller’s translation, “all phenomena are unreal”, should read - “All dhammas (events) are not-self” (nabbe dhammasatta). I noticed also, the word ‘walk’ (pp.390, 432), perhaps a literal translation from the German, where ‘conduit’ or ‘practice’ would have been more appropriate. There is an omission easy to amend, on p.212 of the words "Truth of the End of all Suffering". And from a Vinaya point of view it could be objected that the Buddha stands to address the audience (as on p.306), while, of course, he would have sat cross-legged upon a dais or seat. And on p.384 for 'penury' one should read 'material things'! Apparently a footnote is missing on p.290.

Having noticed these small matters that could easily be corrected, it is time to praise further the very broad Indian knowledge of the author as well as his fine and inspiring style. I do not know if the author had ever been to India, but certainly he impresses us with a fascinating picture of high life in ancient times there. And his picture is very convincing in its wealth of detail. Even his flights of fancy like the fiendishly clever robber priest, Vajrasravas and his Kali or paras, are vivid and like enough to be true.

His story is basically that of a young merchant’s finding of his true love in
a far distant city, and the many difficulties that prevent them from enjoying each other's company thereafter.

All through the long story is woven the figure of Añgulimāla, at first shown as a robber much more terrifying than in the suttas, and later a tuned and compassionate bhikkhu. But at the beginning and near to the end the Buddha is depicted in a heart moving way. For sure the author was a true Buddhist.

Though a large part of the book is Kāmānta's account of his life given to the Buddha during the early part of a night, towards the end his beloved, Vāsīthā, who has practised far on the path as a bhikkhu, discourses on her life, her account of the Buddha's Parinirvāna, and from her great wisdom manages to raise up Kāmānta from his attachment to sensuality and sceptical doubt.

I would call the account of Sukhāvatī (not to be confused with Amida's paradise, but more like one of the six sensu-realm heavens), where they are both born in lotuses, quite superb. If words can express heavenly delights then our author has done a very fine job. When it comes to the couple's next rebirth in the Brahma-world, the writing is even more astonishing and I can only admire the author's excellent and convincing imagination. Finally, there is the attempt to convey their 'going-out' or Nibbāna, which is the finest of most evocative pieces of writing - where words cannot really tell.

Then, of course, there is the Dhamma running like a thread all the way through. The author has very skillfully borrowed pieces of suttas and woven them into the right places in his story.

Anyone who enjoys a good tale and loves the Dhamma will like this book. It could be a good introduction to the Buddha's Teachings for some, while for others it will conjure up those fanzine days when our master walked the land of Jambu.

* First published Frankfurt 1903 and translated into Danish (1906), English (London 1917 and New York 1919), Hungarian (Budapest 1922) and Polish (Editor).

---

A BUDDHIST'S MANUAL
by Ven. Dr. H. Saddhatissa & Russell Webb

REVISED EDITION 1982

This indispensable handbook contains material not easily accessible elsewhere in such a compact collection, with many specially prepared English translations.

CONTENTS include, in Pali and English, Devotional Stanzas, Suttas for Daily Recitation (viz. Mangala, Katta, Metta Suttas, Mahājāyamāgala and Jayamāgala Gāthā), Personal (i.e. marriage and funeral) Ceremonies in Buddhism, The Buddhist Calendar, Principal Centres in Asia and the West, Buddhist Journals, and a detailed Bibliography of easily obtainable books in print.

NOW AVAILABLE - price £2.00 (including postage) - from:

BRITISH MAHABODHI SOCIETY
5 Heathfield Gardens
LONDON W4 4JU

Deutsch – Pali Wörterbuch
Helmut Klar
Octopus Verlag, Wien 1982
364 Seiten, gebunden DM 50.– O.S. 350


Anschrift des Verlages: Am Fleischmarkt 16, A 1010 Wien
A SELF-STUDY COURSE ON BUDDHISM

The Washington Buddhist Vihara has issued a course on Buddhism for home-study. The course, called "The Buddha's Teaching As It Is," contains ten 90-minute cassettes on the basic principles of Buddhism. The lectures were composed and recorded by Bhikkhu Bodhi, an American Buddhist monk. Included in the course is a set of notes and glossary for each lecture, a textbook (What the Buddha Taught by Walpola Rahula), and a list of recommended readings for further study. The course comes in a beautiful three-ring gold binder which is compact and easy to carry about. The price for the whole course — ten cassettes, the textbook, notes, and binder — is only $29.95, inclusive of postage and handling.* To order simply send check or money order with a note to: Vihara Book Service, 5017 - 16th Street N.W., Washington, D.C. 20011. Further information available on request.

*For foreign orders add $6 to cover insured surface mailing; payment in international money order, U.S. currency only.
For further information please write to the Vihara at the above address. Thank you for your cooperation.